



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

APPROVED MINUTES

September 3, 2019, 8:30 a.m.
Committee Room, 2nd Floor, City Hall
101 City Hall Plaza, Durham, NC

I. Call to Order

Chair Jordan called the meeting to order at 8:34 a.m.

II. Roll Call

Members Present:

Joseph Jordan, Chair
Matt Bouchard
Jonathan Dayan
Andrew Goolsby
Katie Hamilton
April Johnson
Tom Kreger
Wanda Waiters

Excused Members Absent:

Tad DeBerry, Vice Chair

Staff Present:

Grace Smith, Planning Manager
Karla Rosenberg, Planner
Terri Elliott, Clerk
Crista Cuccaro, City Attorney's Office

III. Adjustments to the Agenda

None.

IV. Approval of Summary Minutes for August 6, 2019

MOTION: Approve the Minutes from August 6, 2019 (Dayan, Goolsby 2nd).

ACTION: Motion carried, 6-0 (Commissioners Bouchard, Johnson not yet arrived)

V. Swearing-In of Witnesses

Chair Jordan read the opening HPC statement, and asked if there were any early dismissals required by Commission members or Commission members who might have a conflict of interest with the cases presented today. No conflicts of interest were noted, and no early dismissals were requested.

The Clerk to the Board administered the oath to all Citizens and staff who wished to speak at today's meeting.

VI. Certificates of Appropriateness

After the oath was given, Ms. Rosenberg asked that all staff reports and materials submitted at the meeting be made part of the permanent record with any additions, deletions, and or corrections that may be necessary. All Commission members concurred.

Commissioners Bouchard, Johnson arrived before the public hearing.

a. Case COA1900033 – 1706 Fayetteville Street – Addition and Modifications (continued from 8/6/19)

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Miles O’Neill spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Miles O’Neill gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 1706 Fayetteville Street – Addition and Modifications.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application.

MOTION: Commissioner Bouchard made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1900033, 1706 Fayetteville Street - Addition and Modifications:

- The applicant is proposing an addition and modifications to a contributing structure.
- The 50–square foot, one-story addition will attach to the rear of the structure, beneath an existing second-floor overhang, maintaining the existing rear yard setback; the addition will be clad in six-inch German lap wood siding and will have 16-light, fixed, aluminum-clad wood windows.
- One window of the existing rear overhang will be replaced with a six-light-over-two-panel fiberglass door, and the other with a new 16-light, fixed, aluminum-clad wood window.
- A two-story wood staircase will attach at the rear of the new addition and existing second-floor overhang.
- An 80–square foot wood deck will attach to the rear of an existing addition.
- Nonoriginal vinyl windows on the original structure will be replaced with six-over-six, simulated divided-light, double-hung, aluminum-clad wood windows.
- One nonoriginal front doorway will be removed and covered with new wood siding, blended into surrounding original siding; a nonoriginal steel door within the original front doorway will be replaced with a new fiberglass door.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1900033, 1706 Fayetteville Street – Addition and Modifications, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and

3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(Bouchard, Dayan 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 8-0

b. Case COA1900065 – 1103 Ninth Street – Addition and Modifications

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Emily-Kate Hannapel spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Emily-Kate Hannapel gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 1103 Ninth Street - Addition and Modifications.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application.

MOTION: Commissioner Goolsby made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1900065 – 1103 Ninth Street, Addition and Modifications:

- The applicant is proposing a rear shed dormer addition and other modifications to a contributing structure.
- Aluminum siding will be removed from the structure's exterior, including eaves and brackets, and the home's original German wood siding and corner boards will be repaired, selectively replaced, and painted.
- The 100–square foot addition will be constructed with German-style composite wood siding, two-over-two fiberglass-clad wood windows, and an asphalt shingle roof.
- Front porch columns not original to the house will be removed and replaced with new slightly tapered eight- to ten-inch square wood columns.
- The front entry door, also not original, will be replaced with a new half-light-over-three-panel wood door.
- One pair of non-original windows on the front elevation will be replaced with new, two-over-two, fiberglass-clad wood windows to match originals.
- Three windows toward the rear of the (south) side elevation will be removed and replaced with a pair and single unit of two-over-two, fiberglass-clad wood windows.
- One smaller two-over-two, fiberglass-clad wood window will be installed on the (north) side elevation.
- French doors and a window not original to the structure will be removed from the rear elevation and replaced with a 15-light wood exterior door and six new two-over-two, fiberglass-clad wood units to match other windows.
- A masonry stoop with stairs will be constructed at the rear entry.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the

staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1900065, 1103 Ninth Street with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(Goolsby, Bouchard 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 8-0

c. Case COA1900067 – 2009 Englewood Avenue – Demolition of Accessory Structure

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Douglas Marlowe spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Douglas Marlowe gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 2009 Englewood Avenue - Demolition of Accessory Structure.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application without the 365 day delay.

MOTION: Commissioner Dayan made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1900067 – 2009 Englewood Avenue, Demolition of Accessory Structure:

- The applicant is proposing to demolish a contributing accessory structure dating from circa 1950 or earlier.
- The site will be stabilized with grass seed and straw following the demolition.

Therefore, in accordance with UDO requirements and NCGS 160A.400.14, the COA for the proposed demolition is approved without a delay.

(Dayan, Hamilton 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 8-0

d. Case COA1900068 – 2009 Englewood Avenue – New Construction of Accessory Structure

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Douglas Marlowe spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Douglas Marlowe gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 2009 Englewood Avenue - New Construction of Accessory Structure.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application with the condition that the applicant work with staff to ensure that the height of the accessory structure does not exceed that of the primary structure based on the UDO defined height.

MOTION: Commissioner Goolsby made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1900068 – 2009 Englewood Avenue, New Construction of Accessory Structure:

- The applicant is proposing a new accessory structure on a contributing property.
- The structure will measure 20 feet by 28 feet in footprint and may not exceed the maximum height of primary structure as defined by the UDO.
- It will be constructed with cementitious fiberboard siding, wood composite trim, aluminum-clad wood windows, a wainscot-patterned steel roll-up garage door, and asphalt roof shingles.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1900068, 2009 Englewood Avenue with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(Bouchard, Dayan 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 8-0

e. Case COA1900070 – 700 West Main Street – Modifications

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Drew McDonald spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Drew McDonald gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 700 West Main Street – Modifications.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application with the condition that four of the original albeit modified windows be retained on the main street elevation and the four windows on the first floor of the main street elevation be retained.

MOTION: Commissioner Bouchard made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1900070 – 700 West Main Street, Modifications:

- The applicant is proposing to replace all of the windows (some original but modified, and others not original) of a landmark property.
- New windows will consist of eight-over-eight and twelve-over-twelve wood units, matching originals in size and proportion, with an exterior pyramidal muntin profile and E2 glass coating.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1900070 – 700 West Main Street, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein; and
4. The applicant shall retain four original though modified windows from non-front elevations and consolidate those components on the front elevation second story; and
5. The applicant shall retain and store four first floor windows on the front elevation.

(Bouchard, Johnson 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 8-0

MOTION: Excuse Chair Jordan from meeting.

ACTION: Approved 6-0

(Hamilton, Jordan 2nd)

f. Case LD1900002 – Mutual Plaza – Historic Landmark Designation

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Peter Cvelian and Cynthia de Miranda spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Cynthia de Miranda gave a brief overview of the proposed project of Mutual Plaza – Historic Landmark Designation.

Staff Recommendation: Staff would recommend a recommendation for approval of the application.

MOTION: To recommend approval of application.

(Dayan, Goolsby 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 6-0 (Commissioner Hamilton recused, Jordan not present)

g. Case LD1900003 – W. C. and Mary Lyon House – Historic Landmark Designation

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Cynthia de Miranda and Ellen Ciompi spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Cynthia de Miranda gave a brief overview of the proposed project of W. C. and Mary Lyon House.

Staff Recommendation: Staff would recommend a recommendation for approval of the application.

MOTION: To recommend approval of application.

(Johnson, Kreger 2nd) (Commissioners Waiters and Jordan not present)

ACTION: Approved 6-0

VII. Old Business

- a) News Letter Update – final as of last week and ready for approval.

VIII. New Business

- a) Administrative COA updates

IX. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 10:46 a.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Terri Elliott, Clerk
Historic Preservation Commission