



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

APPROVED MINUTES

August 6, 2019, 8:30 a.m.
Committee Room, 2nd Floor, City Hall
101 City Hall Plaza, Durham, NC

I. Call to Order

Chair Jordan called the meeting to order at 8:41 a.m.

II. Roll Call

Members Present:

Joseph Jordan, Chair
Matt Bouchard
Jonathan Dayan
Andrew Goolsby
April Johnson
Wanda Waiters

Excused Members Absent:

Tad DeBerry, Vice Chair
Katie Hamilton
Tom Kreger

Staff Present:

Sara Young, Assistant Planning Director
Karla Rosenberg, Senior Planner
Terri Elliott, Clerk
Crista Cuccaro, Assistant City Attorney

III. Adjustments to the Agenda

Move item e. COA1900060 1907 West Club Boulevard – Demolition before item d. COA1900054 – 411 East Main Street – Sign.

IV. Approval of Summary Minutes for July 9, 2019

MOTION: Approve the Minutes from July 9, 2019 (Bouchard, Waiters 2nd)

ACTION: Motion carried, 6-0

V. Swearing-In of Witnesses

Chair Jordan read the opening HPC statement, and asked if there were any early dismissals required by Commission members or Commission members who might have a conflict of interest with the cases presented today. No conflicts of interest were noted, and no early dismissals were requested.

The Clerk to the Board administered the oath to all Citizens and staff who wished to speak at today's meeting.

VI. Certificates of Appropriateness

After the oath was given, Ms. Rosenberg asked that all staff reports and materials submitted at the meeting be made part of the permanent record with any additions, deletions, and or corrections that may be necessary. All Commission members concurred.

a. Case COA1900044 – 1112 Arnette Street - Modifications

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Frank Lomanno spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Frank Lomanno gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 1112 Arnette Street – Modifications.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application.

MOTION: Commissioner Dayan made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1900044, 1112 Arnette Street - Modifications:

- The applicant is proposing modifications to a contributing structure.
- One existing screened porch will be removed and reconstructed to the exact same specifications.
- The new screened porch with gabled roof will measure approximately 13 feet squared and will be constructed of wood framing with screening mesh, asphalt roof shingles, and a red brick foundation to match the original house. Staff to verify exact square footage.
- One sliding glass door and six windows will be removed from the side and rear of a non-street-facing addition and replaced with new double-hung, six-over-six aluminum-clad wood windows and wood lap siding to match the surrounding windows and cladding.
- One original window will be removed from the rear elevation and replaced with a full-length rear entry door.
- A new wood deck will be constructed across the rear of the structure.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1900044, 1112 Arnette Street - Modifications with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(Dayan, Waiters 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 6-0

b. Case COA1900047 - 2108 West Club Boulevard – Addition, Modifications, Demolition and New Construction

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Sara Lachenman spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Sara Lachenman gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 2108 West Club Boulevard – Addition, Modifications, Demolition and New Construction.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application with additions noted.

MOTION: Commissioner Goolsby made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1900047, 2108 West Club Boulevard – Addition, Modifications, Demolition and New Construction of Accessory Structure:

- The applicant is proposing an expanded second-floor addition, a new first-floor addition, and modifications to a noncontributing primary structure as well as demolition of its accompanying noncontributing garage, and construction of a new garage.
- The expanded addition will convert an existing second-story, rear gabled dormer into a wider shed dormer measuring approximately 176 square feet; it will be clad with wood lap siding to match original second-story siding, and new windows will consist of fiberglass clad wood, double-hung, nine-over-one, triple-grid, simulated divided-light windows.
- One nonoriginal window on the west side elevation will be replaced with a nine-over-one fiberglass clad wood window and five nonoriginal street facing upper story windows will be replaced with fiberglass clad wood twelve light casement windows to match the originals.
- An original garage will be demolished and replaced with a new garage measuring 414 square feet; new garage will mimic the old, with full garage door opening (with retractable fiberglass door), a gabled 5v metal roof, wood lap siding, brick skirting, and a concrete slab foundation.
- Site stabilization will be implemented in the case of delay on the garage.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1900047, 2108 West Club Boulevard – Addition, Modifications, and Demolition and New Construction of Accessory Structure, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all

required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and

3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(Goolsby, Johnson 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 6-0

c. Case COA1900048 - 1907 West Club Boulevard – Addition and Site Work

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Sara Lachenman spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Sara Lachenman gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 1907 West Club Boulevard – Addition and Site Work.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application with minor modifications to motion.

MOTION: Commissioner Goolsby made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1900048, 1907 West Club Boulevard – Addition and Site Work:

- The applicant is proposing a rear addition and site work for a contributing structure.
- The addition will measure 115 square feet and will be constructed with wood cladding; asphalt shingles; six-light, fiberglass wood double-hung and casement windows; and a brick foundation.
- One window to be removed from the west side of the existing addition will be reused in the new addition.
- A wood deck on wood posts with wood railing and stairs will attach to the rear of the structure, measuring 150 square feet; a second wood deck measuring 180 square feet will be installed in the rear at grade.
- An existing gravel driveway will be removed and relocated to the far rear of the property, to measure 540 square feet and to be edged with bricks to match the home.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1900048, 1907 West Club Boulevard – Addition and Site Work with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all

required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and

3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(Goolsby, Waiters 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 6-0

d. Case COA1900060 - 1907 West Club Boulevard – Demolition of Accessory Structure

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Emily Kate Hannapel spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Emily Kate Hannapel gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 1907 West Club Boulevard – Demolition of Accessory Structure.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application.

MOTION: Commissioner Bouchard made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1900060, 1907 West Club Boulevard – Demolition of Accessory Structure:

- The applicant is proposing to demolish a contributing accessory structure dating from circa 1930
- The site will be stabilized with grass seed and straw following the demolition.

Therefore, in accordance with UDO requirement and NCGS 160A.400, the COA for the proposed demolition without a delay.

(Bouchard, Johnson 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 6-0

e. Case COA1900054 – 411 East Main Street – Sign

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Daniel Pearson spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Daniel Pearson gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 411 East Main Street - Sign.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application.

MOTION: Commissioner Waiters made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1900054, 411 East Main Street – Sign:

- The applicant is proposing a monument sign on an undeveloped lot adjacent to church property.
- The monument sign with border and base will measure 56 inches in height by 81 inches in width, and one foot in depth, containing a sign area of approximately three feet by five feet.

- Sign materials will consist of a high-density urethane (HDU) sign painted blue with gold lettering, encased in a brick border and base.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1900054, 411 East Main Street – Sign:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(Waiters, Dayan 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 6-0

f. Case LD1900001 – Brodie L. Duke Warehouse – Partial Land Repeal

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Zack Spencer spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Zack Spencer gave a brief overview of the proposed project of Brodie L. Duke Warehouse – Partial Land Repeal.

Staff Recommendation: Staff would recommend a recommendation for approval of the application.

MOTION: The Brodie L. Duke Warehouse was designated a local landmark in 1999 for its historical and cultural importance, and was included as a contributing structure in the Bright Leaf National Historic District. The land at 321 Liggett Street was included in the original local landmark designation. The parcel does not appear to have ever contained accessory structures pertaining to the Brodie L. Duke Warehouse, nor would the lot have in any case, retained its archaeological potential following paving. Based on the placement of the new property line approximately 75 feet south of the landmark structure, in approximately the same location as it existed historically, the Brodie L. Duke Warehouse and its immediate surroundings will continue to be protected, while the adjacent parcel undergoes development without a Certificate of Appropriate Requirement.

The Commission has determined that the parcel new lot two and attachment three proposed for landmark repeal does not meet the UDO criteria for landmark designation and the Commission recommends the repeal as requested in LD1900001.

(Bouchard, Goolsby 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 6-0

g. Case COA1900033 – 1706 Fayetteville Street – Addition and Modifications

MOTION: Commissioner Bouchard made a motion to continue COA1900033 1706 Fayetteville Street – Addition and Modifications to the September 3, 2019 regular meeting.

(Bouchard, Waiters 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 6-0

VII. Old Business

- a) Newsletter Update
 - Newsletter should be ready next month.

VIII. New Business

- a) Minor COA updates

IX. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 10:13 a.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Terri Elliott, Clerk
Historic Preservation Commission