



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

APPROVED MINUTES

July 7, 2020, 8:30 a.m.
Committee Room, 2nd Floor, City Hall
101 City Hall Plaza, Durham, NC

I. Call to Order

Chair Hamilton called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

II. Roll Call

Members Present:

Matt Bouchard, Vice Chair
Jonathan Dayan
Andrew Goolsby
Katie Hamilton, Chair
April Johnson
Joseph Jordan
Tom Kreger

Excused Members Absent:

Tad DeBerry
Wanda Waiters

Staff Present:

Grace Smith, Planning Manager
Karla Rosenberg, Senior Planner
Terri Elliott, Clerk
Crista Cuccaro, City Attorney's Office

III. Adjustments to the Agenda – None

IV. Approval of Summary Minutes for June 25, 2020

MOTION: Approve the Minutes from June 25, 2020 (Goolsby, Jordan 2nd).

ACTION: Motion carried, 6-0 (Deberry not yet arrived, Dayan abstained)

V. Swearing-In of Witnesses

Chair Hamilton read the opening HPC statement, and asked if there were any early dismissals required by Commission members or Commission members who might have a conflict of interest with the cases presented today. No conflicts of interest were noted, and no early dismissals were requested.

The Clerk to the Board administered the oath to all Citizens and staff who wished to speak at today's meeting.

VI. Certificates of Appropriateness

After the oath was given, Ms. Rosenberg asked that all staff reports and materials submitted at the meeting be made part of the permanent record with any additions, deletions, and or corrections that may be necessary. All Commission members concurred.

a. **COA2000019 - 1111 Georgia Avenue - Demolition of Accessory Structure**

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Jeff Monsein spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Jeff Monsein gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 1111 Georgia Avenue – Demolition of Accessory Structure.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application.

MOTION: Commissioner Goolsby made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA2000019, 1111 Georgia Avenue – Demolition of Accessory Structure:

- The applicant is proposing to demolish a contributing primary structure dating from the 1940s (post-dating the 1920s primary structure).
- The Commission has determined the accessory structure to lack sufficient historical value to preserve it.
- The site will be stabilized with grass seed and straw following the demolition; no further construction has thus far been proposed.

Therefore, in accordance with UDO requirements and NCGS 160A.400.14, the COA for the proposed demolition is approved:

- Without a delay. (Goolsby, Bouchard 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 7-0, (DeBerry not yet arrived)

b. **Case COA2000021 – 2419 West Club Boulevard - Modifications**

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Chad Wilkins spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Chad Wilkins gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 2419 West Club Boulevard – Modifications.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application with the condition of a deed restriction to preserve the original east elevation (now interior to structure) from further changes.

MOTION: Commissioner Jordan made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA2000021, 2419 West Club Boulevard – Modifications:

- The applicant is proposing modifications to a contributing structure.
- An original side porch will be enclosed with nine-light aluminum-clad wood casement windows over solid cementitious fiberboard panels with wainscoting, preserving original porch columns.
- One original window will be removed, and its opening expanded into a French door to match an adjacent original door.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of

Appropriateness for case COA2000021, 2419 West Club Boulevard with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.
4. The applicant will obtain a deed restriction to protect the exterior wall that will thus be made interior for the east elevation of the structure in coordination with Planning Staff and the City Attorney's office.

(Goolsby, Hamilton 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 7-0, (DeBerry not yet arrived)

c. **Case COA2000025 – 1308 Fayetteville Street – Addition, Modifications, Sign, and Site Work**

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Adam Brakenbury and three others spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Adam Brakenbury gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 1308 Fayetteville Street – Addition, Modifications, Sign, and Site Work.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application and is fine with the amendment of the Chinese pitache trees.

MOTION: Commissioner Johnson made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA2000025, 1308 Fayetteville Street – Addition, Modifications, Sign, and Site Work:

- The applicant is proposing an addition, modifications, signage, and site work to a noncontributing structure.
- The addition will consist of a storefront-glazed vestibule within the existing recessed front entry.
- A row of clerestory windows facing the street will be replaced with a new storefront-glazed window system that will match the existing.
- All first-floor street-facing windows will be shielded by transparent polycarbonate panels and perforated metal panels.
- The front walkway will be expanded with new concrete pavers (removing existing low shrubs), and a concrete side walkway will also be relocated and reconfigured.
- Two new street trees (Chinese pistache), or trees as recommended in the *Durham Landscape Manual*, will be planted.
- A brick seat wall up to 30 inches in height will be installed along the front sidewalk, and a monument sign of perforated metal (matching the window shields), measuring 3 feet 10 inches in height, will be installed just beside it.

- Two light-topped metal bollards, approximately three feet in height, will be installed along the front walkway.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA2000025, 1308 Fayetteville Street with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(Johnson, Dayan 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 7-0

(Commission Dayan and Kreger left, and Commission DeBerry joined before the fourth case).

Move COA2000035 318 Liberty Street ahead of case COA20000026 905 West Main Street to ensure we meet a quorum for both cases.

MOTION: Move COA2000035 318 Liberty Street ahead of case COA20000026 905 West Main Street to ensure we meet a quorum for both cases. (Hamilton, Name 2nd)

ACTION: Motion carried, 7-0.

d. **Case COA2000035 – 318 Liberty Street – New Construction and Site Work**

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Joel Dabrowski and three others spoke in support. One person spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Joel Dabrowski gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 318 Liberty Street – New Construction and Site Work.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application with conditions of tree protection measures, and revision of building material from cementitious fiberboard to brick surrounding front entrance at ground level.

MOTION: Commissioner Goolsby made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA2000035, 318 Liberty Street – New Construction and Site Work:

- The applicant is proposing a new primary structure and site work on an existing surface parking lot.

- The new seven-story structure will be constructed with heavily glazed aluminum storefronts along Main and Queen Streets and residential units above; a parking deck will be located at the interior and east side of the structure, screened by perforated metal panels along the Queen Street elevation.
- Building materials will consist of varying tones of brick (in sections of flecked red-orange, tan, and charcoal gray); light and dark gray cementitious fiberboard panels; painted perforated aluminum panels; cast stone cornices; polyvinyl chloride (PVC) one-over-one windows; and coated aluminum-framed storefronts.
- A concrete pedestrian path will follow the western edge of the property, connecting Main Street to Liberty Street; adjacent to it, a retaining wall of concrete masonry units (CMU) faced with brick veneer, capped with cast concrete, and topped with an eight-foot metal fence will surround an elevated playground, and seat walls of the same materials will line Main Street.
- All exterior mechanical equipment will be screened from view by rooftop parapets.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA2000035, 318 Liberty Street with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.
4. The applicant is going to work with City Staff and the adjacent property owner to mitigate impact on neighboring trees during construction of a retaining wall, and the raising and lowering of the project site grade; and
5. Brick will be used at the Main Street entrance at ground level of the first floor.

(Goolsby, Jordan 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 5-0

(Commission Jordan left before the last case).

e. **Case COA2000026 – 905 West Main Street – Modifications**

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Jason Gable and two others spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Jason Gable gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 905 West Main Street - Modifications.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application.

MOTION: Commissioner Johnson made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA2000026, 905 West Main Street - Modifications:

- The applicant is proposing modifications to a landmark property.
- Two original window openings on the Main Street elevation will be expanded into door openings from the bottom only, removing the brick sills and metal shutters, but maintaining the original window widths and arched tops.
- Four canopies not original to the structure will be removed from the original arched doorways across the same elevation and not replaced.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA2000026, 905 West Main Street with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(Johnson, Hamilton 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 3-2 (Deberry, Goolsby voting no)

VII. Old Business - None

VIII. New Business

- a) Revised Rules of Procedure
Motion to approve (Hamilton, Bouchard)
Approved 5-0

IX. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 12:53

Respectfully Submitted,

Terri Elliott, Clerk
Historic Preservation Commission