



# HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

## APPROVED MINUTES

June 1, 2021, 9:00 a.m.  
Virtual Meeting

### I. Call to Order

Chair Bouchard called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

### II. Roll Call

#### Members Present:

Matt Bouchard, Chair  
Jonathan Dayan  
Tad DeBerry  
Laura Fieselman  
Andrew Goolsby, Vice Chair  
April Johnson  
Tom Kreger  
Wanda Waiters

#### Excused Members Absent:

Katie Hamilton

#### Staff Present:

Grace Smith, Planning Manager  
Karla Rosenberg, Senior Planner  
Terri Elliott, Clerk  
Crista Cuccaro, City Attorney's Office  
Chris Peterson, Technology Liaison

### III. Adjustments to the Agenda - None

### IV. Approval of Summary Minutes for April 6, 2021 and May 4, 2021

**MOTION:** Approve the Minutes from April 6, 2021 (Johnson, Fieselman 2<sup>nd</sup>).

**ACTION:** Motion carried, 7-0 (Commissioner Dayan was absent from April 6, 2021 meeting)

**MOTION:** Approve the Minutes from May 4, 2021 as amended (Dayan, Fieselman 2<sup>nd</sup>).

**ACTION:** Motion carried, 7-0 (Chair Bouchard was absent from May 4, 2021 meeting)

### V. Swearing-In of Witnesses

Chair Bouchard read the opening HPC statement and asked if there were any early dismissals required by Commission members or Commission members who might have a conflict of interest with the cases presented today. No conflicts of interest were noted, and one early dismissal was requested.

The Clerk to the Board administered the oath to all Citizens and staff who wished to speak at today's meeting.

## VI. Certificates of Appropriateness

After the oath was given, Ms. Rosenberg asked that all staff reports and materials submitted at the meeting be made part of the permanent record with any additions, deletions, and or corrections that may be necessary. All Commission members concurred.

### a. Case COA2100014 – 162 West Ramseur Street – New Construction

**Staff Report:** Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

**Speakers:** David Arneson and Ashley Young spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

**Discussion:** David Arneson gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 162 West Ramseur Street – New Construction.

**Staff Recommendation:** Staff recommended approval of the application as revised for June and with changes regarding the mechanical equipment.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Dayan made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA2100014, 162 West Ramseur Street – New Construction:

- The applicant is proposing to construct a new noncontributing structure.
- The structure will be six stories tall, with the sixth floor recessed from view.
- Building materials include brick and black aluminum-framed storefront glazing on the ground floor, and fiber-cement (faux wood) panels and black framed aluminum windows and sliding doors on the upper stories.
- Recessed lighting will be installed within the building canopy and a bus stop along South Mangum Street.
- Five new street trees (two “Green Vase” Zelkova along West Ramseur street and three trident maples along South Mangum Street) will be planted.
- Mechanical units will be placed on the roof of the new structure and towards its center about 27 feet from the east side and 30 feet from the west side of the structure, away from street view and concealed.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA2100014, 162 West Ramseur Street with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(Dayan, Waiters 2<sup>nd</sup>)

**ACTION:** Approved 8–0

**b. Case COA2100024 – 212-218 North Dillard Street – New Construction and Site Work**

**Staff Report:** Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

**Speakers:** Scott Harmon spoke, Nilan Patel, and Cassie Smith spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

**Discussion:** Scott Harmon gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 212-218 North Dillard Street – New Construction and Site Work.

**Staff Recommendation:** Staff recommended approval of the application.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Dayan made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA2100024, 212-218 Dillard Street – New Construction and Site Work:

- The applicant is proposing to construct two 3-story multifamily structures containing 19 townhome units and a commercial space on two vacant lots.
- The structures will be set back five to fifteen feet from Dillard Street.
- Materials for the residential portion will include cementitious fiberboard lap siding and raw lumber (KDAT) stoops and benches; materials for the commercial corner will include cementitious fiberboard panels and open wood rain screens with four-inch gaps.
- Windows will consist of aluminum-clad wood units.
- A parking area will front Peachtree Street, with a driveway entry between the buildings accessible from North Dillard Street.
- Twenty-one mature trees to be removed from the site will be replaced by 59 new trees, including swamp white oaks, ginkgos, magnolias, river birch, and crape myrtles.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA2100024, 212 and 218 North Dillard Street with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.
4. Remove black gum trees from COA and replace with one of the following: swamp white oaks, ginkgos, magnolias, river birch, or crape myrtles.

(Dayan, Waiters 2<sup>nd</sup>)

**ACTION:** Approved 6–2, (DeBerry, Goolsby voting no)

**c. Case COA2100027 – 1213 Alabama Avenue – New Construction**

**Staff Report:** Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

**Speakers:** David Darville, Nicholas Levy, Wilma Oliver and Tom Miller spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

**Discussion:** David Darville gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 1213 Alabama Avenue – New Construction.

**Staff Recommendation:** Staff recommended approval of the application, with replacement trees.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Fieselman made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA2100027, 1213 Alabama Avenue – New Construction:

- The applicant is proposing a new 800-square foot, one-and-a-half story structure.
- Two mature oak trees have already been removed from the center of the site to accommodate the new construction; two new oak trees will be planted in the rear yard.
- The house will be constructed of cementitious fiberboard siding, brick veneer siding and foundation (with a German smear mortar wash), architectural shingles, modern metal roofing, and fiberglass windows and doors.
- A ribbon driveway will be located on the far right side of the lot.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA2100027, 1213 Alabama Avenue with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(Fiselman, Bouchard 2<sup>nd</sup>)

**ACTION:** Approved 8–0

**d. Case COA2100036 – 2326 Englewood Avenue – Demolition of Primary Structure**

**Staff Report:** Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

**Speakers:** Chad Wilkins and Nicholas Levy spoke in support. One person spoke in opposition.

**Discussion:** Chad Wilkins gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 2326 Englewood Avenue – Demolition of Primary Structure

*Commissioner Waiters excused early*

**Staff Recommendation:** Staff recommended approval of application with no delay.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Fieselman made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA2100036, 2326 Englewood Avenue – Demolition of Primary Structure:

- The applicant is proposing to demolish a non-contributing primary structure dating from circa 1960.
- The Commission has determined the structure to possess sufficient historical value or structural integrity to preserve it.
- The Commission has determined that the property owner has not shown substantive evidence of facing extreme hardship or of being permanently deprived of all beneficial use of or return from the property by virtue of a delay.

Therefore, in accordance with UDO requirements and NCGS 160A.400.14, the COA for the proposed demolition is approved with a 365-day delay and the intent of Preservation Durham and/or City Staff to support the applicant in finding an option to preserve the building.

(Fieselman, Johnson 2<sup>nd</sup>)

**ACTION:** Approved 5–2 (Goolsby, Kreger voting no)

#### **VII. Old Business**

- a) Newsletters
  - Newsletter with virtual processes – went out last week
  - Fall 2021 Newsletter still in process of drafting

#### **VIII. New Business**

- a) Minor COA updates
- b) Additional items for new business going forward Demolition and Character of the district 160D-948 Statute versus Criteria.
- c) “Ask the Preservation Planner” information sessions (virtual open houses) will be held on June 10, 2021
- d) Retreat information forthcoming

#### **IX. Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned at 12:42 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Terri Elliott, Clerk  
Historic Preservation Commission