



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

DRAFT MINUTES

April 9, 2019, 8:30 a.m.
Committee Room, 2nd Floor, City Hall
101 City Hall Plaza, Durham, NC

I. Call to Order

Chair Jordan called the meeting to order at 8:30 a.m.

II. Roll Call

Members Present:

Joseph Jordan, Chair
Tad DeBerry, Vice Chair
Matt Bouchard
Jonathan Dayan
Andrew Goolsby
Katie Hamilton
April Johnson
Wanda Waiters

Excused Members Absent:

Tom Kreger

Staff Present:

Grace Smith, Planning Supervisor
Karla Rosenberg, Planner
Terri Elliott, Clerk
Crista Cuccaro, City Attorney's Office

III. Adjustments to the Agenda

None.

IV. Approval of Summary Minutes for March 5, 2019

MOTION: Approve the Minutes from March 5, 2019 (Dayan, Waiters 2nd).

ACTION: Approved 8-0

V. Swearing-In of Witnesses

Chair Jordan read the opening HPC statement, and asked if there were any early dismissals required by Commission members or Commission members who might have a conflict of interest with the cases presented today. No conflicts of interest were noted, and no early dismissals were requested.

The Clerk to the Board administered the oath to all Citizens and staff who wished to speak at today's meeting.

VI. Certificates of Appropriateness

After the oath was given, Ms. Rosenberg asked that all staff reports and materials submitted at the meeting be made part of the permanent record with any additions, deletions, and or corrections that may be necessary. All Commission members concurred.

a. Case COA1900005 – 1509 Maryland Avenue - Demolition

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Mr. Black spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Mr. Black gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 1509 Maryland Avenue – Demolition.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application.

MOTION: Mr. Bouchard made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1900005, 1509 Maryland Avenue – Demolition:

- The applicant is proposing to demolish a non-contributing primary structure dating from 1920 as well as a more recent accessory structure.
- The site will be stabilized with grass seed and straw following the demolition; no further construction has thus far been proposed.

Therefore, in accordance with UDO requirements and NCGS 160A.400.14, the COA for the proposed demolition is approved without a delay.

(Bouchard, Waiters 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 8-0

b. Case COA1900008 – 2416 West Club Boulevard - Modifications

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Mr. Wilkins spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Mr. Wilkins gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 2416 West Club Boulevard – Modifications.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application.

MOTION: Mr. Dayan made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1900008, 2416 West Club Boulevard – Modifications:

- The applicant is proposing modifications to the fenestration of a contributing structure.
- Three original wood windows at the rear of the structure will be replaced with smaller fiber-glass clad wood windows to match adjacent windows; new trim will be a wood composite, sized to match original wood trim.
- One original wood window toward the rear of the east side elevation will be removed and infilled with wood siding to match surrounding siding.
- One original wood basement door will be removed from the rear elevation to be infilled with bricks, parged and painted to match surrounding masonry.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1900008, 2416 West Club Boulevard – Modifications, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(Dayan, Waiters 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 8-0

c. Case COA1900010 – 2032 West Club Boulevard – New Construction and Site Work

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Mr. Arneson spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Mr. Arneson gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 2032 West Club Boulevard – New Construction and Site Work.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application.

MOTION: Ms. Johnson made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1900010, 2032 West Club Boulevard – New Construction and Site Work:

- The applicant is proposing a new accessory structure and site work on the property of a contributing structure.
- The two-story accessory structure will measure 12 feet by 10 feet in footprint, and will be constructed with vertical cementitious fiberboard siding, an asphalt-shingled gabled roof with painted wood rafter tails, a painted brick foundation, and four-over-one, aluminum-clad wood, double-hung windows.
- An elevated pressure-treated wood deck will attach to the play house as a landing for a spiral stair and slide.
- A four-foot tall wood slat fence with double gate will be installed along a portion of the north property line and a new gravel lot behind the primary structure; a six-foot tall horizontal steel slat fence with double gate will be installed along portions of the north and east property lines.
- Other site features are documented in the attached materials.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are

consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1900010, 2032 West Club Boulevard – New Construction and Site Work, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(Johnson, Bouchard 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 8-0

d. Case COA1900011 – 610 West Main Street – Addition and Modifications

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Mr. Warasila spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Mr. Warasila gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 610 West Main Street – Addition and Modifications.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application with conditions of working out the details.

MOTION: Mr. Dayan made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1900011, 610 West Main Street – Addition and Modifications:

- The applicant is proposing an addition to a landmark property.
- One window on the Cobb Building (second window from the street) on the east elevation will be removed, along with existing brick infill at the base of the window, to create a doorway.
- A glass vestibule, measuring approximately 16 feet in length, 6.5 feet in depth, and 15 feet in height, will rest upon a concrete stoop, enclosing an area around the new door opening; the glass will be attached to the masonry via penetrations within the mortar joints only, with use of caulking or infill that leaves no residue or discoloration of the brick.
- The horizontal channel connection between glass addition and original masonry will limit penetrations to the vertical mortar joints and will not protrude over brick details.
- A set of poured concrete steps will descend from the stoop to grade, and two poured concrete seat walls ranging in height from 6 inches to 30 inches will line the east and west sides of the courtyard plaza.
- Thirteen trees will be removed, leaving five remaining within the courtyard.
- The trees, fountain, and seat walls will be treated with new uplighting.

- A bocce ball court edged with timbers and lined with synthetic turf will be situated at the northeast corner of the plaza.
- The plaza will be paved with brick pavers.
- The existing leader and down spout will be completely repositioned to the left of the vestibule and will run straight downward; the sprinkler system will run under the archway and will not penetrate any of the bricks.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1900011, 610 West Main Street – Addition and Modifications, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(Dayan, Bouchard 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 7-1, (DeBerry voting no)

e. Case COA1900012 – 1218 Vickers Avenue – Addition

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Mr. Addison spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Mr. Addison gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 1218 Vickers Avenue – Addition.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application.

MOTION: Mr. Bouchard made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1900012, 1218 Vickers Avenue – Addition:

- The applicant is proposing to expand a second-floor addition on a contributing structure from 347 square feet to 784 square feet.
- The addition will be clad in three-inch stained gray cypress wood siding, with a porch area surrounded by a solid railing composed of the same cypress siding and eight-inch square fiberglass columns.
- Windows will consist of double-hung wood units in the rear and north sides, matching those in the first-floor addition, and of casement windows along the south street-facing elevation, to match the home’s original windows.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1900012, 1218 Vickers Avenue – Addition, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(Bouchard, Johnson 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 7-0, (Mr. DeBerry left early)

f. Case COA1900013 – 1219 Fayetteville Street – Modification

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Ms. Hannapel spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Ms. Hannapel gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 1219 Fayetteville Street - Modification.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application.

MOTION: Ms. Hamilton made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1900013, 1219 Fayetteville Street – Modification:

- The applicant is proposing a modification to a contributing structure.
- The nonoriginal front door will be replaced in its existing opening with a new half-light over three-panel wood door to match original doors extant on the structure.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1900013, 1219 Fayetteville Street – Modification, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all

required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and

3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(Hamilton, Waiters 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 6-0, (Ms. Johnson recused, Mr. DeBerry left early)

g. Case COA1900019 – 1007 Taylor Street – Modifications

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Mr. Pretty spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Mr. Pretty gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 1007 Taylor Street - Modifications.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application.

MOTION: Mr. Goolsby made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1900019, 1007 Taylor Street – Modifications:

- The applicant is proposing to reconstruct a partially demolished contributing structure.
- A photograph dating to circa 1980 is the earliest known photograph showing the home's original form and most original features, and should therefore serve as a model for reconstruction, which entails the following:
 - Reconstruction of missing hipped roof and porch overhang with exposed rafter tails, including street-facing gabled dormer with eight-pane horizontal fixed window;
 - Reconstruction of original brick chimney with concrete crown, using salvaged bricks to match foundation, and a soft lime-based mortar (*not* Portland cement);
 - Reconstruction of missing front and side elevations, to be clad with salvaged wood lap siding on the street-facing elevation and cementitious fiberboard siding (smooth side facing out) with the same dimensions, profile, and reveal on side and rear elevations;
 - Replacement of two (front) street-facing windows with wood or aluminum-clad wood, simulated divided-light, double-hung, 12-over-1 windows to match originals; and
 - Replacement of two nine-light over three-panel doors at center of front street-facing elevation.
- Restoration of the front porch decking, foundation, and stoop as well as replacement of rear and side windows were approved in Minor COA1900018.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of

Appropriateness for case COA1900019, 1007 Taylor Street – Modifications, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(Goalsby, Bouchard 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 7-0, (Mr. DeBerry left early)

VII. Old Business

- a) None

VIII. New Business

- a) Administrative COA updates

IX. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 11:37 a.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Terri Elliott, Clerk
Historic Preservation Commission