



DRAFT

Historic Preservation Commission

MINUTES

August 4, 2015 ▪ 08:30 a.m.
Committee Room
Second Floor, City Hall

Members Present:	Matt Biesecker Tad DeBerry Joe Fitzsimons	Joseph Jordan Micah Kordsmeier James Leis
Members Absent:	Jennifer Martin (excused) Dave Neill (excused)	Wanda Waiters (unexcused)
Staff Present:	Joanne Gordon, Planning Karla Rosenberg, Planning	Grace Smith, Planning
Guests Present:	Keith Barnhouse Liz McGuffey Susan Pochapsky Lucy Stokes	Coby Linton Bryan Kane Henry Scherich Jennifer McMillan Rubin

- I. **Call to Order/Roll Call** – Chair Fitzsimons called the meeting to order at 8:33 a.m.
- II. **Approval of Minutes** - None
- II. **Adjustment to the Agenda** – None.
- IV. **Certificates of Appropriateness**

a. COA1500032 – 702 Holloway Street – Modifications

Request: Addition of exterior stair and landing at second-floor level

Location: 702 Holloway Street (Holloway Street Historic District)

Significance: Contributing

Proponents: Anthony McFadden

Discussion: The applicant asked the Commission to continue the case to September 1, 2015.

Motion: The Durham Historic Preservation Commission continued case COA1500032 to the September 1, 2015 meeting. (DeBerry, Leis 2nd)

Action: Approved 6-0

b. COA1500059 – 518 Morehead Avenue – New Construction and Site Work

Request: Construction of four multifamily residential structures on the site, with associated landscaping.

Location: 518 Morehead Avenue (Morehead Hill Historic District)

Significance: None (Vacant)

Proponents: Patrick Woods

Discussion: The applicant asked that the Commission continue the case to September 1, 2015.

Motion: The Durham Historic Preservation Commission continued case COA1500059 to the September 1, 2015 meeting. (DeBerry, Leis 2nd)

Action: Approved 6-0

c. COA1500066 – 2215 West Club Boulevard - Modifications

Request: Modifications to original windows on second level; removal of chimney; removal of non-original rear deck and replacement with new rear deck.

Location: 2215 West Club Boulevard (Watts-Hillandale Historic District)

Significance: Contributing

Proponents: Coby Linton

Opponents: None

Discussion: Ms. Rosenberg presented the case and summarized the staff report to the Commission. Mr. Linton gave a detailed overview of the project, stating that the original chimney would be removed and roofing materials installed to match the existing roof. On the second floor, he will be removing the windows and raising the sill, then patching in original brick to match the existing brickwork. The original width of the window will remain the same.

Mr. Biesecker asked about the vegetation and landscaping. Mr. Linton replied that they have no proposals for the landscaping at this time.

Mr. Kordsmeier asked what they would be doing with the removed windows. Mr. Linton replied that they would be giving them to a clearing house as salvage. Discussion centered on the windows.

Staff Recommendation: Approval

Motion: The Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1500066, 2215 West Club Boulevard - Modifications:

- The windows proposed for alterations are original to the house and located on side of the house in the upper half-story.

- The window alterations will reuse existing historic materials for window construction and infill where possible.
- The proposed new windows consist of two double-hung, simulated divided-light, nine-over-one wood windows and a single, fixed nine-light window.
- The chimney proposed for removal is original to the house and located on the interior near the southwest corner.
- The deck proposed for removal is not original to the house.
- The new deck will measure 15 feet by 30 feet and be constructed of wood.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the *Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation* and the Local Review Criteria, specifically the guidelines listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1500066, 2215 West Club Boulevard – Modifications. (Kordsmeier, Leis 2nd)

Action: Approved 6-0

d. COA1500069 – 101-107 West Chapel Hill Street - Addition

Request: Construction of a 945-square foot penthouse addition to the roof of the contributing structure

Location: 101-107 West Chapel Hill Street (Downtown Durham Historic District)

Significance: Contributing (105-107); Noncontributing (101-103)

Proponents: Keith Barnhouse
Lucy Stokes

Opponents: None

Discussion: Ms. Rosenberg presented the case and summarized the staff report to the Commission. Ms. Stokes gave a detailed overview of the project, stating that they will be adding an approximately 945-square foot penthouse addition to the roof of the structure. The penthouse will have a sloped roof reaching 10 feet at its highest point. The siding will consist of HardiePlank® painted a sandstone color to match the window colors in a previously approved COA. The south side will have a terrace with a covered pergola and fabric shade and a metal railing installed as required by code. The windows and doors will be aluminum-clad wood to match the existing windows.

Mr. Fitzsimons asked for clarification of the block foundation and the view of it from the street. Ms. Stokes stated that the foundation materials would not be visible and were selected for waterproofing. Further discussion centered on the penthouse materials and views of the rooftop of the penthouse from the street.

Staff Recommendation: Approval

Motion: The Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1500069, 101-107 West Chapel Hill Street – Addition:

- The proposed addition and terraces will be set back at least 25 feet from the front roof edge and at least 20 feet from the rear roof edge.

- The addition's siding will consist of cementitious fiberboard painted a sandstone color, installed vertically to resemble board and batten.
- The addition's roof will consist of a low-sloping membrane roof measuring 10 feet in height.
- A painted metal pergola with fabric sunshade will cover the rear terrace, measuring approximately seven inches in height.
- A metal and cable railing will surround both terraces, measuring two feet, two inches in height.
- Windows will consist of double-hung and fixed aluminum-clad wood windows.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition is consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and is consistent with the Local Review Criteria, specifically the guidelines listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1500069, 101-107 West Chapel Hill Street – Modification with the following condition that and changes to the siding be made by staff administratively.(DeBerry, Leis 2nd)

Action: Approved 6-0

V. Landmarks

a. LD1500001 – West Village Complex – Parking Lot

Request: Historic Landmark De-Designation

Location: 600 West Morgan Street (Downtown Durham Historic District)

Proponents: Bryan Kane

Opponents: None

Discussion: Ms. Rosenberg presented the case and summarized the staff report to the Commission. Mr. Kane asked that the Commission to de-designate the parking lot.

Motion: The Durham Historic Preservation Commission recommends that the property, West Village Complex – Parking Lot, located at 600 West Morgan Street be de-designated. (Kordsmeier/Leis 2nd)

Action: Recommended approval of Landmark de-designation to City Council 6-0

b. LD1500002 – Wiley & Elizabeth Forbus House

Request: Historic Landmark Designation

Location: 3307 Devon Road

Proponents: Jennifer McMillan Rubin

Opponents: None

Discussion: Ms. Rosenberg presented the case and summarized the staff report to the Commission. Ms. Rubin stated that the house was constructed in 1930 and was built based on the Norman Provincial architectural style, a rare style throughout the country. The house is listed individually in the National Register of Historic Places and contributes to the Hope Valley National Register District.

Motion: The Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that in the case LD1500002, Wiley & Elizabeth Forbus House that the structure is consistent with the criteria for designation in Section 3.17.4A of the UDO, and therefore recommends that the Wiley & Elizabeth Forbus House be designated as a local historic landmark. (Fitzsimons/DeBerry 2nd)

Action: Recommended approval to City Council 6-0

c. LD1500003 – Imperial Tobacco Building

Request: Historic Landmark Designation

Location: 215 Morris Street (Downtown Durham Historic District)

Proponents: Henry Scherich

Opponents: None

Discussion: Ms. Rosenberg presented the case and summarized the staff report to the Commission. Mr. Scherich stated that the building was constructed in 1916 and is a contributing structure within the Brightleaf National Historic District.

Motion: The Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that in the case LD1500003 - Imperial Tobacco Building, that the structure is consistent with the criteria for designation in Section 3.17.4A of the UDO, and therefore recommends that the Imperial Tobacco Building be designated as a local historic landmark. (Fitzsimons/Kordsmeier 2nd)

Action: Recommended approval to City Council 5-0 (Biesecker recused)

VI. Old Business

a. Design Guidelines Consolidation Update – Staff distributed draft copies of proposed new design guidelines and requested feedback. Mr. Fitzsimons will communicate with the Commission via e-mail to establish a subcommittee to provide requested feedback.

b. Newsletter - Ms. Martin was not present but will provide an update on the newsletter at the next meeting.

VII. New Business

a. Administrative COA updates - Ms. Rosenberg gave the Commission a list of administrative COAs approved over the last month.

b. Announcements and Concerns – Ms. Smith offered to provide an attendance record with meeting minutes at all future meetings as it relates to cases that have been continued.

Ms. Smith showed staff's intent to organize training for all Commissioners and related staff. The City Attorney's office has provided such training in the past.

Mr. Fitzsimons asked about the status of negotiations with and/or efforts of property owners relating to the approved (with condition of 365-day delay) demolition of 2308 West Club Boulevard (COA1500033). The Commission asked Ms. Rosenberg to maintain monthly contact with the owner to assess progress on the Commission's behalf.

VIII. Adjournment - The meeting was adjourned at 9:45 a.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Joanne Gordon
Clerk to the Historic Preservation Commission