



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

DRAFT MINUTES

December 4, 2018, 8:30 a.m.
Committee Room, 2nd Floor, City Hall
101 City Hall Plaza, Durham, NC

I. Call to Order

Chair Jordan called the meeting to order at 8:31 a.m.

II. Roll Call

Members Present:

Joseph Jordan, Chair
Tad DeBerry, Vice Chair
Matt Bouchard
Jonathan Dayan
Joe Fitzsimons
Katie Hamilton
Tom Kreger
Wanda Waiters

Excused Members Absent:

Staff Present:

Sara Young, Planning Assistant Director
Grace Smith, Planning Supervisor
Karla Rosenberg, Planner
Terri Elliott, Clerk
Crista Cuccaro, City Attorney's Office

III. Adjustments to the Agenda

None.

IV. Approval of Summary Minutes for November 20, 2018

MOTION: Approve the Minutes from November 20, 2018 (Fitzsimons, Waiters 2nd).

ACTION: Motion carried, 6-0 (Ms. Waiters, Mr. Dayan not yet arrived).

V. Swearing-In of Witnesses

Chair Jordan read the opening HPC statement, and asked if there were any early dismissals required by Commission members or Commission members who might have a conflict of interest with the cases presented today. No conflicts of interest were noted, and no early dismissals were requested.

The Clerk to the Board administered the oath to all Citizens and staff who wished to speak at the meeting.

Mr. Bouchard and Ms. Waiters need to be excused early. (*Ms. Waiters, Mr. Dayan arrived before swearing-in*)

VI. Certificates of Appropriateness

After the oath was given, Ms. Rosenberg asked that all staff reports and materials submitted at the meeting be made part of the permanent record with any additions, deletions, and or corrections that may be necessary. All Commission members concurred.

a. Case COA1800080 – 211 Rigsbee Avenue – Modifications – continued from November 20, 2018

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Ms. Villanueva spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Ms. Villanueva gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 211 Rigsbee Avenue – Modifications.

Staff Recommendation: Staff would not recommend approval of this application.

MOTION: Hamilton made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1800080, 211 Rigsbee Avenue - Modifications:

- The applicant is proposing to paint previously unpainted brick on a contributing structure.
- Approximately 180 square feet of brick will be painted on each of the north and south side elevations, adjacent to the street-facing elevation.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1800080, 211 Rigsbee Avenue – Modifications, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans submitted to the Commission as part of the application.

(Hamilton, Bouchard 2nd)

ACTION: Denied, 1-7, (Bouchard, DeBerry, Fitzsimons, Hamilton, Jordan, Kreger, Waiters voting no).

b. Case COA1800076 – 1012 Vickers Avenue - Demolition.

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Mr. Vinson and one person spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Mr. Vinson gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 1012 Vickers Avenue – Demolition.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application.

MOTION: Bouchard made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1800076, 1012 Vickers Avenue - Demolition:

- The proposed demolition removes three structures dating from after 1937, which appear to not be contributing to the Morehead Hill Historic District, and to remove walkways, porches, and a dumpster enclosure associated with these structures.

- The applicant has submitted a separate COA application for new construction and site work at this location.
- The applicant has indicated that the structure holds no special significance or value toward maintaining the character of the district.
- The applicant is urged to salvage historic materials existing in building three.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed demolition is consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District, and are consistent with UDO 3.17.3A and the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1800076, 1012 Vickers Avenue – Demolition, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(Bouchard, Dayan 2nd)

ACTION: Approved, 6-1, (Hamilton recused, DeBerry voting no)

- c. **Case COA1800077 – 707 Morehead Avenue and 1012 Vickers Avenue – Relocation, Modifications, New Construction, and Site Work.**

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Mr. Vinson spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Mr. Vinson gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 707 Morehead Avenue and 1012 Vickers Avenue – Relocation, Modifications, New Construction, and Site Work.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application with an amended COA addressing windows and roof and issuance of the COA is conditioned upon approval associated zoning.

MOTION: Fitzsimons made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1800077, 707 Morehead Avenue and 1012 Vickers Avenue - Relocation, Modifications, New Construction, and Site Work:

- The applicant is proposing to relocate and modify a contributing structure, modify a second contributing structure, and complete new construction and site work on the same contributing parcels which will be co-joined.
- The house at 1012 Vickers Avenue will be relocated to the northeast quadrant of the intersection of Proctor and Shepherd Streets, retaining both side wings.
- The original state roof of 1012 Vickers Avenue will be retained or replaced with like kind slate.
- The original French doors at the first floor level of 1012 Vickers Avenue will be retained; its original windows will be repaired.

- The porch addition at 707 Morehead Avenue will be reconfigured, with one-over-one double-hung windows.
- Original stone porch piers will be restored to their original locations, with new wood columns milled and restored to match; nonoriginal metal railings will be removed from the front porch roof and roof of the rear addition.
- 707 Morehead Avenue the proposed reconstructed steps down from the porch will be amended from the application the stone material to match the original.
- A freestanding 36-inch brick wall with perforations at the top will be installed at the edges of the existing porte cochère, making no attachments to the original stone porch piers.
- New semi-attached structures will be constructed along Vickers Avenue, Proctor Street, and Shepherd Street, with two additional units at the interior of the site, connected by a new U-shaped asphalt-paved private drive.
- The new structures will be constructed using brick cladding and walls, wood trim, copper gutters, fiberglass columns, architectural asphalt shingle roofing, and aluminum-clad, triple-grid, six-over-six, wood windows.
- It was discussed in the meeting that this application may be amended in the future to address the concerns the commission had about windows and slate roof on 1012 Vickers Avenue.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1800077, 707 Morehead Avenue and 1012 Vickers Avenue – Relocation, Modifications, New Construction, and Site Work, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.
4. Issuance of the COA is conditioned upon approval associated zoning.

(Bouchard, Dayan 2nd)

ACTION: Approved, 5-0 (Hamilton recused, Bouchard, Waiters excused early, Dayan not present).

d. Case COA1800084 – 803 Vickers Avenue – Site Work.

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Ms. Roberts spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Ms. Roberts gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 803 Vickers Avenue – Site Work.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application.

MOTION: Fitzsimons made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1800084, 803 Vickers Avenue – Site Work:

- The applicant is seeking retroactive approval for front- and rear-yard fences.
- A four-foot wood picket fence has been installed along the front lot line; top caps or finials will be added to each fence post.
- A six-foot wood stockade-type privacy fence with dog-ear styling has been installed along the south side lot line (adjacent to a neighboring property) in the rear yard.
- A wood privacy fence ranging from eight to ten feet in height has been installed along the north side lot lines (adjacent to the Durham Freeway) in the front and rear yards.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1800084, 803 Vickers Avenue – Site Work, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(Hamilton, Fitzsimons 2nd)

ACTION: Approved, 6-0 (Bouchard, Waiters excused early, Dayan, Kreger not present).

e. Case COA1800085 – 1209 Virginia Avenue – Addition and Modifications.

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Mr. Travis spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Mr. Travis gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 1209 Virginia Avenue – Addition and Modifications.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application.

MOTION: DeBerry made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1800085, 1209 Virginia Avenue – Addition and Modifications:

- The applicant is proposing an addition and modifications to a contributing structure.
- The one-story rear addition will measure 457 square feet, with a brick-veneered cement masonry unit foundation; cementitious fiberboard siding; six-over-six, double-hung wood windows with sculpted muntins; a fully glazed fiberglass door; pre-finished K-style gutters and downspouts; and asphalt roofing shingles.
- Two six-over-six wood windows will be installed at the first floor level on the right side elevation, flanking the chimney, sized to fit the original window openings as per physical evidence.
- The front door will be replaced with a new six-light over single-panel wood door to match the existing side door.

- The front porch foundation will be reconstructed and reduced in size to match the original porch overhang, using the existing bricks along the sides, and tongue-and-groove wood flooring; the nonoriginal metal porch columns will be replaced with four 10-inch squared recessed panel wood columns.
- A new garage door will be installed over the original garage door opening.
- Two new condensing units will be installed at the rear of the new addition.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1800085, 1209 Virginia Avenue – Addition and Modifications, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(DeBerry, Hamilton 2nd)

ACTION: Approved, 6-0 (Bouchard, Waiters excused early, Dayan, Kreger not present).

f. Landmark Pre-Application.

MOTION: Move to recommend pre-application be forwarded for a full landmark status.

(Fitzsimons, DeBerry 2nd)

ACTION: Approved, 6-0 (Bouchard, Waiters excused early, Dayan, Kreger not present).

VII. Old Business

- a) Next Steps – Local Review Criteria Update – move to January 8, 2018 meeting.

VIII. New Business

- a) Administrative COA updates
- b) 10-Minute Topic #2: Coatings on Masonry Walls – move to January 8, 2018 meeting.

IX. Adjournment

This meeting adjourned at 12:10 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Terri Elliott, Clerk
Historic Preservation Commission