

Historic Preservation Commission

February 5, 2019, 8:30 a.m.
Committee Room, 2nd Floor, City Hall
101 City Hall Plaza, Durham, NC

1. Call To Order

2. Roll Call

Matt Bouchard
Jonathan Dayan
Tad DeBerry
Joe Fitzsimons
Katie Hamilton
Joseph Jordan
Tom Kreger
Wanda Waiters

3. Adjustments To Agenda

4. Approval Of Minutes
Draft Minutes - January 8, 2019

Documents:

[HPC MINUTES 1-8-19 DRAFT.PDF](#)

5. Swearing-In Of Witnesses

6. Certificates Of Appropriateness - Staff Person Karla Rosenberg, Planner
- None

7. New Business
a. Brief Presentation by Local Government Federal Credit Union
b. Administrative COAs
c. 10-Minute Topic #2: Coatings on Masonry Walls

8. Old Business
a. Local Review Criteria update

9. Adjournment



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

DRAFT MINUTES

January 8, 2019, 8:30 a.m.
Council Chambers, 1st Floor, City Hall
101 City Hall Plaza, Durham, NC

I. Call to Order

Chair Jordan called the meeting to order at 8:36 a.m.

II. Roll Call

Members Present:

Joseph Jordan, Chair
Tad DeBerry, Vice Chair
Matt Bouchard
Jonathan Dayan
Joe Fitzsimons
Katie Hamilton
Wanda Waiters

Excused Members Absent:

Tom Kreger

Staff Present:

Grace Smith, Planning Supervisor
Karla Rosenberg, Planner
Terri Elliott, Clerk
Don O'Toole, City Attorney's Office

III. Adjustments to the Agenda

Add two denials orders that will need to be signed - under Old Business

- a. COA1700077 – 104 West Parrish Street – Public Art
- b. COA1800080 – 211 Rigsbee Avenue – Modifications

IV. Approval of Summary Minutes for December 4, 2018

MOTION: Approve the Minutes from December 4, 2019 (Bouchard, DeBerry 2nd).

ACTION: Approved, 6-0

V. Swearing-In of Witnesses

Chair Jordan read the opening HPC statement, and asked if there were any early dismissals required by Commission members or Commission members who might have a conflict of interest with the cases presented today. No conflicts of interest were noted, and no early dismissals were requested.

The Clerk to the Board administered the oath to all Citizens and staff who wished to speak at today's meeting.

VI. Certificates of Appropriateness

After the oath was given, Ms. Rosenberg asked that all staff reports and materials submitted at the meeting be made part of the permanent record with any additions, deletions, and or corrections that may be necessary. All Commission members concurred.

a) Case COA1800091 – 2116 West Club Boulevard – Demolition of Accessory Structure

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Mr. Black spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Mr. Black gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 2116 West Club Boulevard – Demolition of Accessory Structure.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application with no condition of a 365 day delay.

MOTION: Mr. Bouchard made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1800091, 2116 West Club Boulevard – Demolition of Accessory Structure:

- The applicant is proposing to demolish a contributing accessory structure.
- The structure, while apparently original or added early to the site, does not bear a strong resemblance or connection to the primary structure, nor does it possess distinctive architectural features.
- The site will be graded away from the house and stabilized with grass seed and straw following demolition if a new structure is not built within three months' time.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with North Carolina General Statute 168-400.14, the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1800091, 2116 West Club Boulevard – Demolition of Accessory Structure, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(Bouchard, Dayan 2nd)

ACTION: Approved, 6-0

b) Case COA1800095 – 900 Arnette Avenue – New Construction and Site Work

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Mr. Barron spoke in support. One person spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Mr. Barron gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 900 Arnette Avenue – New Construction and Site Work.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application.

MOTION: Ms. Hamilton made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1800095, 900 Arnette Avenue – New Construction and Site Work:

- The applicant is proposing to construct a two-story stacked duplex with driveway.
- The structure will be constructed of cementitious fiberboard siding (smooth side facing out), asphalt roofing shingles, and a parged cement masonry unit (CMU) foundation.
- Windows will be one-over-one, double-hung, aluminum-clad wood windows with five-inch smooth cementitious fiberboard trim, and the door will be fiberglass.
- A rear stacked deck with stairs will be constructed of wood at the rear corner of the structure using six-inch posts.
- A single-width gravel driveway edged with either 4x4 lumber or reclaimed bricks will utilize an existing curb cut and extend to the rear of the new structure, expanding at the rear for two-car parking.
- The front porch will be constructed with parged cement masonry unit (CMU) foundation with painted tongue and groove decking and stairs as well as painted wood railing.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1800095, 900 Arnette Avenue – New Construction and Site Work, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way, including a street closing; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.
4. This COA will be issued upon closure or withdrawal of right-of-way.

(Hamilton, Waiters 2nd)

ACTION: Approved, 5-1 (Dayan voting no)

c) **Case COA1800096 – 617 Morehead Avenue – Addition, Modifications, and Site Work**

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Mr. Bates spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Mr. Bates gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 617 Morehead Avenue – Addition, Modifications, and Site Work.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application.

MOTION: Mr. Dayan made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1800096, 617 Morehead Avenue – Addition, Modifications, and Site Work:

- The applicant is proposing a one-story rear addition to a contributing structure.
- The addition will measure 1,210 square feet and will be constructed with red brick cladding and a red brick foundation to closely match the original structure.
- The low-sloped roofs of the existing addition and the new addition will be covered with a gray membrane roofing material.
- The new addition will have six-over-six, double-hung, aluminum-clad wood windows and two-and four-light aluminum-clad wood transoms; the aluminum-clad wood doors will be fully glazed.
- Two trees will be removed from the area, and a parking lot will be paved at the rear of the parcel, along with a new driveway across the adjacent parcel.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1800096, 617 Morehead Avenue – Addition, Modifications, and Site Work, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way, including a street closing; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(Dayan, Bouchard 2nd)

ACTION: Approved, 6-0

d) Case COA1800097 – 1407 Maryland Avenue – Addition and Modifications

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Mr. Harris spoke in support. Two people spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Mr. Harris gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 1407 Maryland Avenue – Addition and Modifications.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application clarifying the window type – wood window triple grid, corner trim, foundation on the exterior wall will be changed to brick.

MOTION: Mr. DeBerry made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1800097, 1407 Maryland Avenue – Addition and Modifications:

- The applicant is proposing modifications and an addition to a contributing structure.
- A nonoriginal rear porch overhang will be removed to allow for the new 831-square foot single-story addition and a 416-square foot wood deck.
- The addition will be constructed with horizontal wood lap siding, six-over-six wood windows, architectural asphalt shingles, and a brick foundation.
- Two original rear windows will be salvaged from the rear elevation and reused on the addition.
- Corner board will be designed to match the originals.
- A nonoriginal front door will be replaced with a six-light over two-panel fiberglass door.
- A single-width poured concrete driveway edged with brick on one side will replace the existing gravel drive.
- A four-foot wide poured concrete walkway will extend in an L shape from the home's front steps to the adjacent drive.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1800097, 1407 Maryland Avenue– Addition and Modifications, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and

(DeBerry, Jordan 2nd)

ACTION: Approved, 6-0

e) Case COA1800098 – 829 Clarendon Street – Addition and Modifications

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Ms. Hylton-Daniel spoke in support. No one person spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Ms. Hylton-Daniel gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 829 Clarendon Street – Addition and Modifications.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application.

MOTION: Mr. Bouchard made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1800098, 829 Clarendon Street – Addition and Modifications:

- The applicant is proposing a two-story rear addition to a noncontributing structure with a footprint of approximately 350 square feet.

- The addition will be constructed with cementitious fiberboard siding; a brick foundation to match the existing; one-over-one, aluminum-clad wood windows; fully glazed aluminum-clad wood patio doors; and asphalt roof shingles.
- Two bronze-finished wall sconces will be placed, one on either side of patio doors.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1800098, 829 Clarendon Street – Addition and Modifications, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(Bouchard, Dayan 2nd)

ACTION: Approved, 6-0 (Ms. Hamilton left early)

VII. Old Business

- a) Next Steps-Local Review Criteria Update – Karla passed out the latest edition and Rules of Procedure. She hopes to have them finalized when we meet in February.
- b) Two orders of denials will need to be signed by Chair and a motion to approve the orders.
 - COA1700077 – 104 West Parrish Street Public Art
 - COA1800080 – 211 Rigsbee Avenue – Modifications

MOTION: (Dayan, DeBerry 2nd)
Approved, 6-0 (Ms. Hamilton left early)

VIII. New Business

- a) Administrative COA updates
- b) 10-Minute #2: Coatings on Masonry Walls – Move to next February’s meeting.
- c) Annual Election of Officers:
 - Election of Chair
MOTION: Nominate Mr. Jordan as Chair (Bouchard, Dayan 2nd)
Approved, 6-0 (Ms. Hamilton left early)
 - Election of Vice Chair
MOTION: Nominate Mr. DeBerry as Chair (Bouchard, Dayan 2nd)
Approved, 6-0 (Ms. Hamilton left early)
- d) Annual Report – Needs letter by February 1, 2019, deadline in March
- e) Update on open positions
 - Historian position went to Council January 7, 2019
 - Architect position will go to Council January 22, 2019

IX. Adjournment 11:30 a.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Terri Elliott, Clerk
Historic Preservation Commission